

4-th Official meeting of the Joint Decision Making Committee

EaPTC Programme Moldova-Ukraine

## Programme Implementation Review

13-th of June 2019, Kyiv

Erk Roeloffs, Team Leader (Managing Authority North)

Tatiana Udrea, Finance and Contract Officer

Catalina Arghir, Finance and Contract Officer

Mariana Schaumberger, Finance and Contract Officer



This Programme is co-funded by the European Union



This Programme is  
implemented by GIZ



## Contents

- ✓ Basic overview
- ✓ Management structures and key actors
- ✓ Financial Framework
- ✓ Timelines and processes
- ✓ Evaluation, Contracting and Implementation
- ✓ Monitoring, coaching, reporting
- ✓ Programme result indicators achieved
- ✓ Small infrastructure works
- ✓ Budget utilization data
- ✓ Sustainability of the Action
- ✓ Lessons learnt



This Programme is co-funded by the European Union



This Programme is  
implemented by GIZ



## Basic overview



European Commission  
DG NEAR

**giz**

Deutsche Gesellschaft  
für Internationale  
Zusammenarbeit (GIZ) GmbH

### Overall objectives:

Promotion of sustainable territorial cooperation

Support of social and economic development

EU Delegation Agreement  
for Indirect Centralized  
Method of Implementation

13 December 2013



This Programme is co-funded by the European Union



This Programme is  
implemented by GIZ

**giz** Deutsche Gesellschaft  
für Internationale  
Zusammenarbeit (GIZ) GmbH

## Basic overview

### Geographic Eligibility

Whole territory



Chernivtsi oblast  
Vinnytsya oblast  
Odesa oblast



## Operational objectives

## Basic overview

### Objective I IMPROVING THE LIVING CONDITIONS

- Promotion of closer business links across the border
- Diversification of income sources and development of alternative employment opportunities in rural areas

### Objective II ADDRESSING COMMON CHALLENGES

- Solving cross-border environmental problems, enhancing emergency preparedness

### Objective III CULTURE, EDUCATION, SPORTS

- Promotion of multi-cultural diversity and social integration of ethnical minorities across the border
- Facilitation of people-to-people links in social sphere, culture, education and sport with focus on youth issues



## Management structures and map of actors



## Management structures and map of actors

### Target Groups

**State actors:** local and regional authorities and public service providers such as hospitals, educational, research and cultural institutions, communal service providers and associations.

**Non-state actors:** civil society organizations (CSOs) in all their diversity such as independent political and research foundations, citizens' initiatives and unions, youth organizations and SME associations



This Programme is co-funded by the European Union



This Programme is  
implemented by GIZ



## Financial framework

Total EU Contribution budgeted **EUR 3.300.000,00**

Share in the total funding **90%**

Amount of EU contribution per Grant Contract **EUR 60.000,00 – EUR 300.000,00**

| Allocation of EU<br>Contribution per Objective |   | <u>PLANNED</u>   | <u>REDISTRIBUTED</u> |
|--|---|------------------|----------------------|
|  |   | EUR 1.320.000,00 | EUR 1.334.400,00     |
|  | Objective I<br>IMPROVING THE LIVING<br>CONDITIONS |                  |                      |
|  | Objective II<br>ADDRESSING COMMON<br>CHALLENGES   | EUR 1.320.000,00 | EUR 1.375.600,00     |
|  | Objective III<br>CULTURE, EDUCATION,<br>SPORTS    | EUR 660.000,00   | EUR 590.000,00       |



## Timelines and processes

### Programme Implementation Timeline

#### Preparation of the call for Proposals

##### 1-st JDMC Meeting

10/6/2014

Information Days

4/27/2015

5/8/2015

#### Evaluation of the Projects

Opening & Administrative Check and Concept Note Evaluation

7/24/2015

11/16/2015

Evaluation of Full Application Forms and Appeal process

1/16/2016

5/25/2016

Eligibility check

4/27/2016

7/14/2016

##### 2-nd JDMC Meeting

5/30/2016

Approval of the Evaluation (EC and BMZ)

8/24/2016

12/21/2016

Approval of the Main and Reserve Lists of selected applications (EC and BMZ)

8/24/2016

12/21/2016

Implementation Training / 73 participants

1/30/2017

2/3/2017

Awarding and signing Grant Contracts

2/1/2017

#### Projects Implementation period

Implementation Phase / Signature of the Grant Contracts

11/8/2017

4/15/2019

Training on Project Implementation and Reporting / 58 participants

01-02/02.2018

First round on-site monitoring visits

April - May 2018

First round of Interim reporting

6/8/2018

9/8/2018

Second round of on-site monitoring visits

12/1/2018

1/1/2019

##### 3-d JDMC Meeting

12/6/2018

Second round of Interim reporting

12/1/2018

2/1/2019

Individual coaching on the final reporting

1/12/2018

present

Final Reporting

1/12/2018

present

##### 4-th JDMC Meeting

6/13/2019

Program Closure

6/1/2019

6/27/2019



This Programme is co-funded by the European Union



This Programme is implemented by GIZ



## Evaluation, contracting and implementation

|   |     |
|---|-----|
| Applications received under CfP                 | 154 |
| Meetings of the Evaluation Committee            | 7   |
| External experts contracted for evaluation      | 11  |
| Meetings of the Appeal Committee                | 2   |
| Applications revised under the Appeal Procedure | 2   |
| Applications awarded and contracted             | 16  |
| Lead Applicants/Coordinators from Moldova       | 12  |
| Lead Applicants/Coordinators from Ukraine       | 4   |

## Evaluation, contracting and implementation

|  |       |
|--|-------|
| Preparatory Information day sessions                     | 6     |
| Target group attendees of the Information sessions       | > 500 |
| Precontracting visits carried out                        | 16    |
| Implementation Training for beneficiaries - participants | 73    |
| Training on reporting - participants                     | 58    |
| On-site monitoring visits conducted                      | 34    |
| Project Financial Reports verified                       | 37    |
| Project Narrative Reports verified                       | 37    |
| Project Auditor Reports verified                         | 37    |
| Training sessions for MA Team                            | 2     |

## Programme result indicators achieved

### General programme indicators

| Indicator   | Measured by:  | Target | Achieved |
|---|---|--------|----------|
| Increased level of structured and institutionalized contacts between local authorities of the bordering regions | Number of applications received in response to a call for proposals | 120    | 154      |
|   | Number of organizations involved in the applications                | 336    | 500      |
| Number of joint projects implemented across the borders   | Number of grant contracts signed                                    | 20     | 16       |
|   | Number of projects completed  | 20     | 16       |
| The increased intensity of cross-border contacts between the local communities                                  | Number of joint cross-border events implemented within the projects | 75     | 200      |

## 1. Improving the living conditions of local communities in the border regions through joint projects supporting economic and social development

|  |  |     |
|--|--|-----|
| 1.1 Promotion of closer business links across the border | Number of SMEs/ entrepreneurs that took part in events organised by the projects/benefited from the actions  | 204 |
|  | Number of cross-border partnerships/ initiatives/ business networks and clusters established   | 2   |
|  | Number of newly established cross-border partnerships between local and regional academic institutions, think tanks, research centres                      | 2   |
|  | Number of joint researches, studies, strategies on regional social-economic development issues published   | 11  |
|  | Number of joint cross-border events/ conferences/ seminars/ workshops organised by the projects to address issues to the cross-border business development | 7   |
|  |  |     |



## 1. Improving the living conditions of local communities in the target cross-border regions through joint projects supporting economic and social development

1.2 Diversification of income sources and development of alternative employment opportunities in rural areas

|  |    |
|--|----|
| Number of new joint vocational education and training curricula upgraded, developed and introduced | 40 |
|--|----|

|   |     |
|---|-----|
| Number of SMEs/entrepreneurs based in the rural areas across the border using the outputs of the projects | 179 |
|---|-----|

|   |     |
|---|-----|
| Number of stakeholders covered by cross-border education projects | 174 |
|---|-----|

|   |    |
|---|----|
| Number of new working places for young people created in the services sector in rural areas | 11 |
|---|----|

|   |   |
|---|---|
| Number of joint cross-border events/ conferences/ seminars/ workshops organised by the projects to address issues related to cross-border rural development | 8 |
|---|---|

## 2. Addressing common challenges

2.1 Solving cross-border environmental problems, enhancing emergency preparedness

|  |              |
|--|--------------|
| Number of newly established cross-border structures and mechanisms, efficiently managing protected areas and natural resources           | <b>3</b>     |
| Number of established/supported networks to exchange information and coordinate protection measures                                      | <b>5</b>     |
| Number of joint management plans/ strategies developed and/or implemented  | <b>10</b>    |
| Number of people targeted by information/awareness activities promoting sustainable use of natural resources                             | <b>13828</b> |
| Number of partnerships established between emergency institutions across the border  | <b>3</b>     |
| Number of institutionalised and sustainable cross border partnerships, networks, associations and other structures                       | <b>7</b>     |
| Number of joint cross-border events/ conferences/ seminars/ workshops organised by the projects to address issues related to environment | <b>22</b>    |

## 3. Culture, education, and sports

|   |  |      |
|---|--|------|
| Promotion of multi-cultural diversity and social integrity of ethnical minorities across the border | Number of people who participated in various cultural and sports events, competitions, festivals, conferences                    | 574  |
|   | Number of people with improved knowledge about the traditions, situation and issues of their neighbours across the border        | 87   |
|   | Number of cultural events organised  | 10   |
|   | Number of participants involved in cultural events   | 800  |
|   | Number of information and promotion materials produced to promote cultural diversity and social integrity of ethnical minorities | 1472 |

## III. Culture, education and sports

|   |  |             |
|---|--|-------------|
| Facilitation of people-to-people links in social sphere, culture, education and sports with focus on youth issues | Number of organisations and people involved in cross-border activities   | <b>2479</b> |
|   | Number of initiatives launched and implemented   | <b>79</b>   |
|   | Number of joint cross-border events/ conferences/ seminars/ workshops organised by the projects involving participation of youth and other civil society organisations | <b>133</b>  |
|   | Number of cross-border networks involving youth/ educational/ cultural/ social organisations established and supported   | <b>2</b>    |

## Small infrastructure works

| Country of Applicant                                    | Application number | Contract Number | Coordinator   | Total budget EUR | EU contribution EUR | Infrastructure Improvement cost, EUR | Construction in MD, EUR | Construction in UA, EUR |
|---|--------------------|-----------------|---|------------------|---------------------|--------------------------------------|-------------------------|-------------------------|
| MD  | 12/P1/1.2          | 83263425        | Institute for Development and Social Initiatives (IDIS) “Viitorul”                      | 283.000,00       | 254.700,00          | 45.000,00                            | 27.000,00               | 18.000,00               |
| UA  | 59/P2/2.1          | 83249068        | RMI “Emergency Hospital”  | 336.528.00       | 291.848,00          | 40.423,00                            | 3.000,00                | 37.423,00               |
| MD  | 77/P2/2.1          | 83248905        | Edinet City Hall  | 285.488,00       | 256.939.00          | 68.800,00                            | 28.900,00               | 39.900,00               |
| MD  | 91/P3/3.2          | 83248937        | Ungheni City Hall   | 262,394.10       | 236,154.70          | 77.380,00                            | 52.180,00               | 25.200,00               |
| MD  | 118/P3/3.2         | 83249116        | Cross-border Cooperation and European Integration Agency                                | 142.313,00       | 127.370,14          | 0                                    |                         | 0                       |
| MD  | 147/P2/2.1         | 83248979        | Cross-border Cooperation and European Integration Agency                                | 109.660,00       | 98.145,70           | 10.000,00                            | 10.000,00               | 0                       |
| MD  | 139/P1/1.2         | 83248962        | Institute of Genetics, Physiology and Plant Protection of Academy of Science of Moldova | 300.000,00       | 270.000,00          | 17.000,00                            | 5.000,00                | 12.000,00               |
| Amount of Infrastructure Component performed in Ukraine |                    |                 |   |                  |                     |                                      |                         | 132.523,00              |
| Amount of Infrastructure Component performed in Moldova |                    |                 |   |                  |                     |                                      |                         | 126.080,0               |
| Total amount of Infrastructure Component                |                    |                 |   |                  |                     | 258.603,00                           |                         |                         |
| Total Moldova-Ukraine Budget                            |                    |                 |   | 3.300.000,00     |                     |                                      |                         |                         |



## Small infrastructure works

### 91/P3/3.2, Healthy way by Upgraded Cross-border Sport Infrastructure

BEFORE



PRESENT



## Small infrastructure works

### 59/P2/2.1, RMI “Emergency Hospital”, Chernivtsy

BEFORE



PRESENT





## Budget utilization data

|    | Beneficiary name   | Nationally of the beneficiary | Duration months | Total budget, €     | EU contribution, €  | Co-financing, €   | Total budget, €     | EU contribution, €  | EU contribution % | Co-financing, €   | Status            |
|----|--|-------------------------------|-----------------|---------------------|---------------------|-------------------|---------------------|---------------------|-------------------|-------------------|-------------------|
|    |  |                               |                 | Planned             | Planned             | Planned           | Actual spend        | Actual spend        | Actual            | Actual spend      |                   |
| 1  | "Agricola" NGO   | UA                            | 12              | 109,430.00          | 98,487.00           | 10,943.00         | 93,151.79           | 83,836.61           | 90.0%             | 9,315.18          | Closed            |
| 2  | (IDIS) "Viitorul"  | MD                            | 15              | 283,000.00          | 254,700.00          | 28,300.00         | 273,544.16          | 246,189.74          | 90.0%             | 27,354.42         | Closed            |
| 3  | ODIMM  | MD                            | 15              | 263,535.65          | 234,546.73          | 28,988.92         | 246,683.85          | 219,548.63          | 89.0%             | 27,135.22         | Closed            |
| 4  | "Euroregion «Dniester»" NGO                              | UA                            | 12              | 297,125.00          | 267,412.00          | 29,713.00         | 292,527.01          | 263,274.31          | 90.0%             | 29,252.70         | Closed            |
| 5  | RMI "Emergency Hospital"                                 | UA                            | 15              | 336,528.00          | 291,848.00          | 44,680.00         | 278,643.71          | 241,639.83          | 86.7%             | 37,003.88         | Report – revision |
| 6  | Edinet City Hall   | MD                            | 16              | 285,488.00          | 256,939.00          | 28,549.00         | 260,655.67          | 233,924.40          | 89.7%             | 26,731.27         | Report – revision |
| 7  | "STABILITATE" NGO  | MD                            | 14              | 90,350.00           | 80,411.50           | 9,938.50          | 88,836.19           | 79,064.21           | 89.0%             | 9,771.98          | Closed            |
| 8  | Ungheni City Hall  | MD                            | 15              | 262,394.10          | 236,154.71          | 26,239.39         | 255,359.92          | 229,823.93          | 90.0%             | 25,535.99         | Report - revision |
| 9  | Falesti District Council                                 | MD                            | 15              | 299,112.00          | 269,200.00          | 29,912.00         | 273021.95           | 245,719.76          | 90.0%             | 27302.2           | Report – revision |
| 10 | Civil Protection and Emergency Situations Service        | MD                            | 15              | 329,894.90          | 296,905.41          | 32,989.49         | 304,839.28          | 269,062.41          | 88.3%             | 35,776.86         | Report – revision |
| 11 | Cross-border Cooperation and European Integration Agency | MD                            | 15              | 142,313.00          | 127,370.14          | 14,942.86         | 133,393.53          | 119,387.21          | 89.5%             | 14,006.32         | Report – revision |
| 12 | "Business-Center" NGO                                    | MD                            | 12              | 252,549.00          | 227,294.10          | 25,254.90         | 214,904.25          | 193,413.83          | 90.0%             | 21490.43          | Closed            |
| 13 | Institute of Genetics of Moldova                         | MD                            | 15              | 300,000.00          | 270,000.00          | 30,000.00         | 278,871.39          | 250,939.21          | 90.0%             | 27932.18          | Report – revision |
| 14 | Social Services Centre for Child and Family              | MD                            | 15              | 143,330.00          | 128,000.00          | 15,330.00         | 137,869.00          | 122,959.31          | 89.2%             | 14,909.69         | Closed            |
| 15 | Cross-border Cooperation and European Integration Agency | MD                            | 12              | 109,900.00          | 98,145.70           | 11,754.30         | 93,578.48           | 83,565.58           | 89.3%             | 10,012.90         | Closed            |
| 16 | Carpinineni Village Hall                                 | MD                            | 9               | 290,015.00          | 162,585.17          | 127,429.29        | 235,226.95          | 211,704.25          | 90.0%             | 23,522.70         | Report – revision |
|    |  |                               |                 | <b>3,794,964.65</b> | <b>3,299,999.46</b> | <b>494,964.65</b> | <b>3,461,107.13</b> | <b>3,094,053.22</b> | <b>89.4%</b>      | <b>367,053.92</b> |                   |

Absorption rate of TOTAL EU Contribution budget **89.40%**



This Programme is co-funded by the European Union



This Programme is implemented by GIZ



## Lessons learnt

### **The main issues encountered on the project level were:**

- ✓ The projects need the full range of training (implementation training – training on interim and final reporting), as foreseen by the Description of the Action;
- ✓ Discrepancy between the experience in managing EU projects stated in the Applications and “experienced” by MA;
- ✓ Coaching: Transfer of knowledge by MA ensured increase in quality of reports;
- ✓ The projects need more networking for finding synergies;
- ✓ Common monitoring missions EU-Commission / EU Delegation and GIZ/MA;
- ✓ Division of tasks between MA and subcontracted organization (Support Programme). Working packages must be clearly defined and budgeted;
- ✓ Beneficiaries with the lack of experience need additional informational support and helpdesk.



This Programme is co-funded by the European Union



This Programme is  
implemented by GIZ



**Ukraine: Дякую за увагу!**

**Moldova: Multumesc pentru atentie!**

**Belarus: Дзякую за ўвагу!**

**Georgia: გმადლობთ ყურადღებისთვის!**

**Armenia: Շնորհակալություն ուշադրության համար!**

**Azerbaijan: Diqqətinizə görə təşəkkür edirik**

**GIZ: Vielen Dank für Ihre Aufmerksamkeit!**

**EU: Thank you for your attention!**

**Merci pour votre attention!**



This Programme is co-funded by the  
European Union



This Programme is  
implemented by GIZ

Implemented by





## Lessons learnt

### 3.5. Summary of the main obstacles and lessons learned

The main issues encountered on the Programme level within the implementation phase of the EaPTC Programme BY-UA were:

UA were:

- legal framework issue related to Art. 2.5 in the Delegation Agreement between the EC the MA which resulted to almost a year of delay for the Implementation;
- absence of a detailed comparative analysis of the legislation bases for BY and UA in terms of finance, tax administration, labor laws, etc. during the preparation stage of the Programme;

The main issues encountered on the project level were:

- issue with state registration of the grant contracts by the MoE/BY;
- substantial time lapse between the Programme phases caused by the issues of the Programme delay;
- serious lack of experience in EC projects handling;
- the projects need more coaching in EU and local legislation than expected;
- the projects need more networking for finding synergies;

**Thank you for your attention!**



This Programme is co-funded by the European Union



This Programme is  
implemented by GIZ

